

Schwarzschild and Synge once again

Hans - Jürgen Schmidt

<http://www.physik.fu-berlin.de/~hjschmi>, e-mail: hjschmi@rz.uni-potsdam.de

Institut für Mathematik, Universität Potsdam, Am Neuen Palais 10, D-14469 Potsdam, Germany

Abstract

We complete the historical overview about the geometry of a Schwarzschild black hole at its horizon by emphasizing the contribution made by J. L. Synge in 1950 to its clarification.

KEY: Schwarzschild solution; Synge; black hole; horizon

1 Introduction

P. Florides raised the point¹ that the contribution of Synge for the clarification of the geometry of the Schwarzschild horizon is still not adequately known to the scientific community. It is the purpose of the present note to fill this gap.

In 1916, the paper [1] appeared whose resulting solution is now known as the Schwarzschild solution. The most well-known early discussion about its horizon is [2] and [3]; there, Einstein erroneously believed to have proven that no particle can cross the horizon of a Schwarzschild black hole. In [4], however, by use of the coordinates later named Eddington-Finkelstein coordinates, examples of particles crossing the horizon could be constructed. But the complete geometry near the horizon was still unclear that time.

2 Heckmann's view of Synge's paper

In 1951, O. Heckmann from Hamburg/Germany published the following notes [5]² about the Synge-paper [6] from 1950: "The known metric

$$ds^2 = e^{-\lambda} dr^2 + r^2(d\theta^2 + \sin^2 \theta d\varphi^2) - e^\lambda dt^2$$

with $\lambda = \ln(1 - a/r)$; $a = \text{const.} > 0$, is assumed to be a singular one at $a = r$ in almost every paper about General Relativity Theory. The paper by Synge shows however, that this singularity can be removed by a suitable choice of coordinates. The time-like geodesics (paths of particles) and the null-like geodesics (light rays) are discussed in details, and the result is that a particle can indeed cross the place $r = a$; then, after a finite eigentime, it reaches $r = 0$ at light velocity. The paper by Synge contains many interesting results all of them being discussed in details."³

¹in his plenary lecture at the Conference GR17 in Dublin, July 18-24, 2004

²Translation from the German original by H.-J. Schmidt

³Translator's note: Nowadays the parameter a is almost always replaced by $2m$.

3 Discussion

In [7], Ehlers wrote: “An outstanding achievement of Synge’s was the first complete analytic extension of the Schwarzschild field.”, but he did not give the related source. In fact, it is Synge [6] entitled “The gravitational field of a particle”, and this seems really to be the first among many sources of this result.

For more details see [8]; there it is also proposed to replace the notion “inside the horizon” by “after the horizon”. This is not only done from the formal point of view because r is time-like at $r < 2m$, but also from the mental point of view: A result, that a particle cannot leave the region “after the horizon”, is not a strange new behaviour from relativity theory, but nothing but a variant of the well-known classical result that it is not possible to return from the future back to the past.

Note added: Further details can be found in [9]. In [10], Lemaitre (1933) showed, though not the complete analytic extension of the Schwarzschild solution, (similarly as Eddington [4] did in 1924), that the surface $r = 2m$ is a fictitious singularity.

Acknowledgement

I am grateful to A. Gsponer and S. Robertson for valuable comments to the first version of this paper.

References

- [1] K. Schwarzschild: Sitzungsber. Preuss. Akad. Wiss., Phys.-Math. Klasse (1916) 189. Translation from the German original in: Gen. Rel. Grav. **35** (2003) 951 by S. Antoci und A. Loinger. Editor’s Note to this paper: S. Antoci und D.-E. Liebscher: Gen. Rel. Grav. **35** (2003) 945.
- [2] E. Trefftz, Mathem. Ann. **86** (1922) 317.
- [3] A. Einstein: Sitzungsber. Preuss. Akad. Wiss., Phys.-Math. Klasse (1922) 448.
- [4] A. S. Eddington: Nature **113** (1924) 192.
- [5] O. Heckmann: Zentralbl. Math. **36** (1951) 426.
- [6] J. L. Synge: Proc. Irish Acad. A **53** (1950) 83-114.
- [7] J. Ehlers: Gen. Rel. Grav. **34** (2002) 2171.
- [8] H.-J. Schmidt: Im Zwischenreich der Bilder, Eds.: R. Jacobi, B. Marx, G. Strohmaier-Wiederanders, EVA Leipzig (2004), page 267 (in German language).
- [9] A. Gsponer, preprint physics/0408100.
- [10] G. Lemaitre, Ann. Soc. Sc. Brux. A **53** (1933) 51, reprinted in Gen. Rel. Grav. **29** (1997) 641.